

## Video Notes for Component 3b: *Questioning and Using Discussion Techniques* (Highly Effective)

### Materials:

- **Video link:** [http://www.youtube.com/watch?feature=player\\_embedded&v=IfEU5shbmbw](http://www.youtube.com/watch?feature=player_embedded&v=IfEU5shbmbw)

### Overview:

Effective questioning is instrumental in helping students succeed. Not only does questioning help teachers assess the extent to which students understand the lesson’s content in order to adjust instruction accordingly, but high level questions also help students engage in productive learning that will prepare them to be college and career ready.

In order to meet the rigorous Common Core standards, teachers must use effective questioning and discussion strategies to deepen student understanding of content, encourage students to make connections among concepts and develop new insights about complex material. Component 3b: *Questioning and Using Discussion Techniques* in the [Louisiana Compass Teacher Rubric](#) describes the key indicators of this practice, which include:

- The teacher asks questions that challenge students cognitively, advance high level thinking and discourse, and promote meta-cognition;
- Students initiate higher-order thinking questions and other contributions to the conversation; and
- Students ensure that other voices are heard in the discussion.

The teacher in this 12<sup>th</sup> grade English Reality PD © video demonstrates *Highly Effective*, Common Core-aligned instruction under this component. Examples of key evidence from the video, aligned to language in the Compass Teacher Rubric, are provided below to substantiate this rating.

### Common Core Connection:

- **RL.11-12.10:** Students are asked to read and understand a poem that is appropriately complex for grades 11-12.
- **SL.11-12.1a-d:** Through a teacher-established questioning protocol, students initiate and participate in collaborative discussions with diverse partners about a grade-appropriate text. Having read the material under study, students come prepared to the discussion and stimulate a thoughtful, well-reasoned exchange of ideas. They build on others’ ideas and express their own clearly and persuasively, explicitly drawing on their preparation by referring to evidence from the text. Additionally, students work with peers to promote civil discussions and establish individual roles, propel the conversations by posing and responding to questions that probe reasoning and evidence, and respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives and synthesize comments and claims.
- **RL.11-12.1:** The teacher expects students to cite textual evidence to support their analysis of what the text says explicitly and any inferences they draw from the text.
- **L.11-12.5a:** Finally, through their analysis, students demonstrate understanding of figurative language, as they interpret figures of speech in context and analyze the role of the figures of speech in the text.

### Rubric Indicators and Rationale Used to Determine Ratings:

Indicators	Evidence and Rationale
Students initiate higher-order questions.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>“I also have a question. It says that ‘the Thing the Lord God made and gave/ To have dominion over sea and land.’ I want to just know, and I’m asking anybody in here, does anybody know what the ‘Thing’ is because I see that it is capitalized like it’s something important?”</i></li> <li>• <i>“Was the poem written for the picture or was the picture drawn for the poem? Do they have any connection?”</i></li> </ul>

	<p><b>Through the whole group and partner discussion, students are allowed the opportunity to pose questions to their peers and discuss what they were thinking when they read the text.</b></p>
Students extend the discussion, enriching it.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• First student states, <i>“I feel like he’s saying, if he doesn’t feel like he’s thinking or is educated, then he’s a slave to whoever is more educated or has more knowledge than he does.”</i> Second student responds, <i>“Yeab, I agree with what you’re saying…”</i></li> </ul> <p><b>When student states their opinion of the text, other students extend the discussion and dialogue, building off each other’s responses.</b></p>
Students invite comments from their classmates during a discussion.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• First student states, <i>“I want to just know, and I’m asking anybody in here, does anybody know what the ‘Thing’ is because I see that it is capitalized like it’s something important.”</i> Second student responds, <i>“It’s about the same that she’s talking about, the ‘Thing,’ I think it’s slavery.”</i></li> </ul> <p><b>Through the whole group discussion, students ask questions to one another, inviting comments from other students and listening respectfully to their peers.</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>“Turn and talk to your partner. Pick out a couple of important pieces of text in the poem that relate to some of the questions that you’ve asked and prepare yourself for a seminar.”</i></li> </ul> <p><b>During the turn and talk time, students are engaged in paired discussion to talk and think about possible answers without ongoing teacher mediation.</b></p>
Teacher uses open-ended questions, inviting students to think and/or have multiple possible answers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>“Why did you pick out this?”</i> and <i>“Why did you ask that question?”</i> and <i>“What do you see when you look at this painting?”</i></li> <li>• <b>The teacher asks students questions that advance high level thinking. By inviting students to reflect in pairs and as a whole group, students are able to build on their responses during the seminar.</b></li> </ul>
The teacher makes effective use of wait time.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>While the majority of questions Ms. Agnew asks receive a quick response from the student called upon, she allows ample time for students to respond to questions, ranging from three to five seconds.</b></li> </ul>
The teacher builds on student responses to questions effectively.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>“And then you also, why did you pick out this?”</i> <i>“...I want you to think about how these images might relate to that idea, that comparison.”</i></li> </ul> <p><b>When the teacher checks in with students during the paired discussion, she pushes the students to think critically about their responses by posing additional questions instead of providing explanation.</b></p>
Discussions enable students to talk to one another without ongoing mediation by the teacher.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>While the teacher facilitates part of the whole group discussion, students are encouraged to ask questions of their peers and build off of each other’s responses.</b></li> </ul>
The teacher calls on most students, even those who don’t initially volunteer.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>“So I would like to hear from four or five different people about what you see when you look at this painting.”</i></li> <li>• <b>Within the clips of this video, we see Ms. Agnew use strategies like this one to engage more students in the discussion, and we hear from 13 different students.</b></li> </ul>
Many students actively engage in the discussion.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Through the whole group and paired activity, all students are actively engaged in discussion.</b></li> </ul>

### Additional Rationale Used to Determine Rating:

This teacher is rated *Highly Effective* and not *Effective: Proficient* on component 3b: *Questioning and Using Discussion Techniques* because:

- The teacher structures whole group and paired discussions such that students are empowered to ask questions, contribute new ideas, and build on each other’s responses with minimal teacher intervention.

- The teacher constantly asks questions that prompt higher-level thinking and metacognition by students.

**Evidence-based Notes:**

Note: This is by no means an exhaustive set of the notes that could be taken from this video. Notes that are underlined were used to make a determination on 3b.

Evidence		
TIME	TEACHER ACTIONS	STUDENT ACTIONS
00:10	T: I'm Melanie Agnew, and I'm the 12 <sup>th</sup> grade English teacher at Calvin Coolidge Senior High School and today we're going to analyze a poem.	
	T: What are some of the tools that you know a poet has to create tone and theme?	S1: Imagery.
	T: Ok, imagery.	S2: Feelings.
00:31	T: Good morning. Everyone has their journals and you should have today's date.	S3: Diction.
	T: I think that students are their own best teachers and that the best thing that I can do is sharpen their ability to ask questions and look for their own answers. It's something that I'm always working on and trying to get better at.	
01:01	T: <u>So I would like to hear from four or five different people about what you see when you look at this painting.</u> William?	S4: The man is tired from working in the field.
	T: Okay, so the man is tired from working in the field. When you said he was tired, what in the painting made you feel like he was tired?	S4: Because he's leaning on the thing and he looks tired.
	T: Okay, so the position of his body makes him look tired to you. Marel?	S2: In the background, I see mountains and smoke.
	T: Okay, in the background you see mountains and smoke. That's something you actually see. Erica?	S5: He looks weary because, like, when someone is usually working outside, it's heroic and he looks tired and lowly because he's out there all by himself.
	T: That's such a good connection.	
01:40	T: In this lesson, when students first were looking at the painting, I heard some things like the body position and the smoke in the background and the town is so far away and the expression on the face, and they're looking at these very discreet things that make them feel like there's a certain mood or tone or feeling or idea in the painting.	

<p>02:16</p>	<p>T: So if there's a poet, Edward Markham, who actually wrote a poem about this painting and that's the poem that we're going to analyze today. So we are going to use collaborative inquiry to analyze this poem so somebody tell me, what's the first thing we do in collaborative inquiry? Read and?</p> <p>T: Annotate and render. So what does that mean when we render the text? What does that mean?</p> <p>T: Yes, you're underlining, you're circling. What are you looking for the first time?</p> <p>T: Imagery.</p>	<p>Unidentified student: Annotate.</p> <p>Multiple students respond.</p> <p>Unidentified student: Imagery.</p>
<p>02:35</p>	<p>T: Daniel, would you please read for us? <i>The Man with a Hoe</i>.</p> <p>T: Then when my students looked at the print text, the things they picked out were sometimes very discreet things and I think that by starting with the non-print text, you activate their close reading because I'm asking them for them to look at very specific discreet things visually and then asking them to do the same thing in a print text.</p>	<p>S1: <i>The Man with a Hoe</i>, by Edward Markham. Bowed by the weight of centuries...</p>
<p>03:04</p>	<p>T: While there is certainly more writing and thinking to be done, let's pause for a moment and share what our thoughts are. Shay, can you start us off? What's an image that you picked out?</p>	<p>S1: How will the future reckon with this man?</p> <p>S6: The first image I picked out was the first three lines. Of course, it matches the painting we saw but I also have a question. It says that "the Thing the Lord God made and gave/To have dominion over sea and land" I want to just know, and I'm asking anybody in here, does anybody know what the "Thing" is because I see that it is capitalized like it's something important?</p>
<p>03:43</p>	<p>T: So we're going to hold answering that question. That's a great question, and when we share out in the seminar, that's definitely a question we can investigate.</p> <p>T: I teach students to evaluate questions, to differentiate between levels of questions, and then to generate those questions based on what their need is.</p> <p><u>T: And then you also, why did you pick out this?</u></p>	<p>S7: <u>William gave me that idea, and he said that an ox works in the field and he works in the field so it's comparing the man and the ox.</u></p>
<p>04:17</p>	<p>T: So now, when we think of an ox, what kind of animal is an ox?</p> <p>T: So it's not necessarily a graceful and beautiful animal. It's just a hard-working strong and earthly. <u>So when he makes that comparison there, now as you go through</u></p>	<p>S4 and S7: Strong.</p>

04:43	<p><u>the end of the poem, I want you to think about how these images might relate to that idea, that comparison.</u></p> <p>T: Okay, scholars. Please pause your questioning and your investigation just for a moment so that we can share and collect a common list of questions. Let's start with clarifying questions. Did anybody have a right there or a clarifying question that they had to ask? Mename?</p>	
05:14	<p>T: Okay, so a right there question is something that we can point to. So would that be a right there question?</p> <p>T: What kind of question would that be?</p> <p>T: That's a higher level question, yes.</p>	<p><u>S8: It's about the same that she's talking about, the thing. I think it's slavery.</u></p> <p>S8: It wouldn't.</p> <p>S8: It would be a think and search.</p>
05:37	<p>T: When they're investigating and taking it apart, they're activating all the different parts of their brains and really getting into stuff. And I want them to feel like that. I want them to be excited about asking tough questions. I want them to ask a lot of questions.</p> <p>T: <u>Okay, why did you ask that question?</u></p> <p>T: That's a great question.</p>	<p>S9: How is this poem related to Marx's criticism?</p> <p>S9: Because when it talks about the protests, which is also a prophecy, it sounds like they're going to rebel against the people who are richer than them.</p>
06:06	<p>T: I think that in the academic world, it's important because the further they go, the more questioning they'll have to do on their own.</p> <p>T: I think it's also just about curiosity. You know, I want my students to be interested and not all of the things that we teach are interesting in their own right. But by developing their ability and interest in asking questions, it opens the whole world to them.</p>	<p>S10: <u>Was the poem written for the picture or was the picture drawn for the poem? Do they have any connection?</u></p>
06:39	<p>T: And we are going to spend some time organizing our thoughts and preparing for a discussion. So which of these questions do you think are the most rigorous or challenging questions?</p> <p>T: Avery?</p> <p>T: Okay, that's a really great question.</p> <p>T: So we're looking at all the different biblical allusions at all the different places in the poem.</p> <p>T: <u>Turn and talk to your partner. Pick out a couple of important pieces of text in the poem that relate to some of the questions that you've asked and prepare yourself for a seminar.</u></p>	<p>S11: When she asks about how the poem is related to Marx's criticism.</p> <p>S2: What is the significance of biblical allusions?</p> <p>Students discuss in pairs.</p>

<p>07:07</p>	<p>T: Alright, so we are going to begin the seminar. I'm going to remind you that some of the thematic questions invite us to talk about things outside of the text, which is okay, but we want to always make sure we relate it back to the text. Alex?</p>	<p>S12: The way that she questions us, it challenges us because it makes us open our minds to writing, reading and analyzing stuff because we'll already be prepared for higher level questions in our mind since we're questioning the text already.</p>
<p>07:39</p>	<p>T: Can you read it again?</p>	<p>S13: The question is, how do his thoughts and feelings relate to his freedom? I think that in the poem, it says, to whose breath blew out the light within this brain. It's in the first stanza right there.</p> <p>S13: <u>To whose breath blew out the light within this brain. I feel like he's saying, if he doesn't feel like he's thinking or is educated, then he's a slave to whoever is more educated or has more knowledge than he does.</u></p>
<p>08:12</p>		<p>S11: <u>Yeh, I agree with what you're saying. Just looking at it, like saying whose breath blew out the light within this brain, they're saying that they blew out the educational knowledge of this man because he could be a slave, so yeh, I agree with you.</u></p> <p>S1: With the burden on his back, he understands that he's so far away from his life from when he first started. It's like he was on a ship in the middle of the water and he thought he was sailing one way and then realized he sailed to the wrong shore.</p>
<p>08:47</p>	<p>T: That was a really good answer. That was great. So, some of the things that I think contribute to him responding in this way are the protocols earlier in the lesson. When students are rendering the text and start off by identifying what is most important to them, these allusions are things that Daniel pulled out and that other students pulled out and they all picked these things out and shared them first so that they can see that there is something going on with these allusions throughout the poem and this is just an example of a really beautiful, a-ha moment where he's hearing the things that his classmates have picked out.</p>	
<p>09:30</p>	<p>T: Excellent job with this. To close the class, we're going to...</p> <p>T: I feel so inspired by the opportunity to see little grownups develop their ability to ask questions about themselves and the world and to develop the skills to really live great lives. I just can't believe that I get to do that. I love being a teacher.</p>	